

V&R Academic

Reformed Historical Theology

Edited by
Herman J. Selderhuis

in co-operation with
Emidio Campi, Irene Dingel, Elsie McKee,
Richard Muller, Risto Saarinen, and Carl Trueman

Volume 32

G. Stephen Weaver, Jr.

Orthodox, Puritan, Baptist

Hercules Collins (1647 – 1702) and Particular Baptist
Identity in Early Modern England

Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht



Bibliographic information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek
The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie;
detailed bibliographic data available online: <http://dnb.d-nb.de>.

ISSN 2198-8226
ISBN 978-3-525-55086-1
ISBN 978-3-647-55086-2 (e-book)
ISBN 978-3-666-55086-7 (V&R eLibrary)

You can find alternative editions of this book and additional material on our website: www.v-r.de

© 2015, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht GmbH & Co. KG, Göttingen/
Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht LLC, Bristol, CT, U.S.A.
www.v-r.de

All rights reserved. No part of this work may be reproduced or utilized in any form or by any means,
electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage and
retrieval system, without prior written permission from the publisher.

Printed in Germany.

Printed and bound by CPI buchbuecher.de GmbH, Birkach.

Printed on aging-resistant paper.

Contents

| | |
|---|----|
| List of Abbreviations | 9 |
| Chronology of the Life and Works of Hercules Collins | 11 |
| List of Figures | 13 |
| Preface | 15 |
| Foreword by Crawford Gribben | 19 |
| Introduction | 21 |
| 1. Personal Interest | 21 |
| 2. State of the Question | 22 |
| 3. Thesis and Methodology | 25 |
| Chapter 1. “Faithful to the Last”: The Life and Legacy of Hercules Collins | 27 |
| 1.1 Introduction | 27 |
| 1.2 Early Life and Family | 29 |
| 1.3 “Not a Learned Education”: Education and Occupation | 31 |
| 1.4 Beginning of Persecution | 35 |
| 1.5 Particular Baptist Origins and the Wapping Church | 38 |
| 1.5.1 John Spilsbury (1593–c. 1662/1668) | 39 |
| 1.5.2 John Norcott (1621 – 1676) | 39 |
| 1.6 Hercules Collins: Pastor | 41 |
| 1.7 Wapping: The Early Years | 43 |
| 1.8 The Era of Persecution | 45 |
| 1.8.1 Prison Writings | 48 |
| 1.8.2 Counseling <i>The English Spira</i> : John Child | 50 |

| | | |
|---|---|-----|
| 1.9 | The Rise of Toleration | 52 |
| 1.9.1 | A New Meeting House | 53 |
| 1.9.2 | The London General Assemblies (1689–1692) | 53 |
| 1.9.3 | Financial Provision for Ministers | 55 |
| 1.9.4 | Relationship with Other Pastors | 57 |
| 1.9.4.1 | Benjamin Keach | 57 |
| 1.9.4.2 | William Kiffin | 59 |
| 1.9.4.3 | Hanserd Knollys | 61 |
| 1.9.5 | Falsely Accused | 61 |
| 1.10 | Concern for the Coming Generation | 63 |
| 1.11 | Death and Character of Collins | 68 |
| 1.11.1 | Circumstances of Death | 68 |
| 1.11.2 | A Faithful Pastor | 68 |
| Chapter 2. “Orthodox”: Hercules Collins and Historic Christianity . . . | | 71 |
| 2.1 | Introduction | 71 |
| 2.2 | Caffyn and the General Baptist Response | 72 |
| 2.3 | Collier and the Particular Baptist Response | 74 |
| 2.4 | Collins and <i>An Orthodox Catechism</i> | 76 |
| 2.5 | Use of the Creeds | 77 |
| 2.6 | Use of the Fathers | 81 |
| 2.7 | Patristic Theology | 84 |
| 2.7.1 | Nicaeno-Constantinopolitan Trinitarianism | 84 |
| 2.7.2 | Chalcedonian Christology | 87 |
| 2.8 | Conclusion | 91 |
| Chapter 3. “Puritan”: Hercules Collins and Reformed Protestantism . . | | 93 |
| 3.1 | Introduction | 93 |
| 3.2 | Defining Puritanism | 94 |
| 3.3 | Baptists and Puritanism | 94 |
| 3.4 | Puritan Hermeneutics | 99 |
| 3.4.1 | The Necessity of the Holy Spirit | 102 |
| 3.4.2 | The Grammatical-Historical Method | 104 |
| 3.4.2.1 | Historical Context | 105 |
| 3.4.2.2 | Scriptural Context | 107 |
| 3.4.2.3 | Meaning of Words | 108 |
| 3.4.2.4 | Figures of speech | 108 |
| 3.4.3 | The Analogy of Faith | 111 |
| 3.4.4 | Christocentrism | 113 |
| 3.5 | Puritan Homiletics | 118 |
| 3.5.1 | Use of Term “Prophecy” | 118 |

| | | |
|---|--|-----|
| 3.5.2 | Plain Style Preaching | 119 |
| 3.5.3 | Application of Scripture | 119 |
| 3.5.4 | Qualifications of Ministers | 120 |
| 3.5.5 | Use of Commonplace Books | 121 |
| 3.5.6 | Use of Memory in Preaching | 121 |
| 3.6 | A Puritan Approach to Persecution | 122 |
| 3.6.1 | <i>Counsel for the Living</i> | 123 |
| 3.6.2 | <i>A Voice from the Prison</i> | 126 |
| 3.7 | Conclusion | 132 |
| Chapter 4. “Baptist”: Hercules Collins and Baptist Ecclesiology | | 133 |
| 4.1 | Introduction | 133 |
| 4.2 | Definition of the Church | 133 |
| 4.3 | Religious Liberty | 136 |
| 4.4 | Congregationalism | 137 |
| 4.4.1 | A Dispute from Prison | 138 |
| 4.4.2 | A Charge of “Lording” | 140 |
| 4.4.3 | Summary | 142 |
| 4.5 | The Sacraments | 142 |
| 4.6 | Baptism | 148 |
| 4.6.1 | Definition of “Baptism” | 153 |
| 4.6.2 | Great Commission Texts | 155 |
| 4.6.3 | New Testament Example Texts | 158 |
| 4.6.4 | Baptist Covenant Theology | 159 |
| 4.6.5 | Summary | 163 |
| 4.7 | The Lord’s Supper | 164 |
| 4.7.1 | Defining Terms | 166 |
| 4.7.2 | Two Catechisms and a Confession | 169 |
| 4.7.2.1 | Hercules Collins and <i>An Orthodox Catechism</i> | 170 |
| 4.7.2.2 | William Collins and <i>A Brief Instruction in the Principles of Christian Religion</i> | 171 |
| 4.7.2.3 | Second London Confession of Faith | 173 |
| 4.7.3 | Kiffin, Knollys and Keach | 175 |
| 4.7.3.1 | William Kiffin | 176 |
| 4.7.3.2 | Hanserd Knollys | 177 |
| 4.7.3.3 | Benjamin Keach | 180 |
| 4.7.4 | Eligible Participants of the Supper | 182 |
| 4.7.5 | Summary | 190 |
| 4.8 | Other Ordinances? | 190 |
| 4.8.1 | Laying On of Hands | 191 |
| 4.8.2 | Singing of Hymns | 192 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| 4.8.3 Summary | 195 |
| 4.9 Conclusion | 195 |
| Chapter 5. Conclusion: Hercules Collins and Baptist Identity | 197 |
| 5.1 Introduction | 197 |
| 5.2 Summary of Arguments | 198 |
| 5.3 Implications for Questions of Baptist Identity | 200 |
| Appendix | 203 |
| Appendix 1. Hercules Collins' Tombstone | 203 |
| Appendix 2. List of Books Purchased for "Gifted Brethren" | 204 |
| Bibliography | 209 |

Foreword by Crawford Gribben

Hercules Collins was, as Stephen Weaver suggests in this important addition to scholarship on early modern religious history, a foremost theorist of Baptist identity and pioneer in Reformed ecumenism. Born during the first civil war, he found his way into a new religious movement that was still struggling to find its feet in the polemical world of English Protestantism, and dedicated himself to providing his Baptist brethren with the theological resources by which they could make sense of their situation as their circumstances grew ever more desperate.

Collins' first major literary project was to prepare *An Orthodox Catechism* (1680), which combined the modesty of its title with content which drew heavily upon the European Reformed tradition, even as it argued implicitly for a commonality of conviction between the mainstream Reformed tradition and the new religious movement which sought to modify that tradition while appreciating many of its values. He later signed the new confessional text which was adopted by the English Baptist General Assembly (1689), a statement of faith that adapted the Westminster Confession and Savoy Declaration within the frame of believers' baptism and a "visible saints" ecclesiology, and which continued the task of identification and appropriation which he had begun in his first publication. But Collins was also a staunch defender of the particularity of his religious community. Many of his subsequent publications reflect his long experience as pastor of a fellowship of baptized Christians that was still negotiating the problematic balance of the privileges and responsibilities of the laity and their leaders.

Stephen Weaver's study of Collins represents a major break-through in the scholarship of early modern religious radicalism, as well as in the history of Baptists. A great deal of recent writing on English Baptist origins – and on contemporary American Baptist politics – has worried about the relationship between the new fellowships of baptized Christians and the theological traditions of the Reformed. Both the heirs and the antagonists of the English Particular Baptists have debated whether the movement can properly be understood

as being “Reformed.” Undoubtedly many early Baptists were strongly critical of the hegemonic claims of, for example, the Westminster Assembly. But many others, perhaps benefitting from the political environment of the Restoration, which brought Baptists and many of their critics together in the shared “experience of defeat,” came to appreciate and to identify with the legacy of the English reformation. Collins’ life and literary legacy reflects the growing tendency of English Baptists to attempt to recover a Reformed identity, in the context of ever more detailed debate within the new religious movement about what it might mean to be a member of a congregation of baptized believers.

Orthodox, Puritan, Baptist is the first sustained discussion of the contribution of one of the most important of early Baptist leaders. It will be warmly welcomed by the growing community of historians, church leaders and general readers who continue to draw their own spiritual resources – as well as much of their religious identity – from the first generations of Christians who combined their convictions about the baptism of believers with gratitude for all that had been accomplished in the Calvinist reformation.

Crawford Gribben
Queen’s University Belfast
March 2015